

Walt and Mearsheimer's "The Israel Lobby"

- Fails to Meet Academic Standards**
- Includes Factual Errors**
- Carries Anti-Semitic Overtones**

The Israel Lobby and US Foreign Policy is a new book by Harvard Professor Stephen Walt and University of Chicago Professor John Mearsheimer. The book is based on an original article, which was widely criticized for failing to meet scholarly standards, for its factual distortions and for its innuendoes about a Jewish conspiracy in the U.S.

StandWithUs has prepared the following booklet to help you counter the misinformation.

Produced By

StandWithUs

“The Israel Lobby” is a biased work that fails to meet basic academic standards.

Here are some important reviews:

Shoddy Scholarship, Distorted Facts and Faulty Analysis

“The ‘facts’ presented by Mearsheimer and Walt suggest a fundamental ignorance of the history with which they deal, and that the ‘evidence’ they deploy is so tendentious as to be evidence only of an acute bias.”¹

– *Benny Morris, Historian*

“Walt/Mearsheimer’s paper, complete with footnotes that misstate primary sources and ignore others, is worse than embarrassing. It is academic malpractice. No one contests their right to their opinions, but they are not entitled to their own facts – nor to pass them off as the conclusions of ‘scholars.’”²

– *Rick Richman, Editor of “Jewish Current Issues”*

“[Walt and Mearsheimer] quote only those people who basically have this point of view and don’t take a serious look at anything in a more profound way. It is masquerading as scholarship . . . I would say this is an effort to take a point of view and give it academic legitimacy.”³

– *Dennis Ross, Former U.S. Envoy to the Middle East*

“Not only are these charges wildly at variance with what I have personally witnessed in the Oval Office over the years, but they also impugn the loyalty and the unstinting service to America’s national security by public figures. . . . As a Christian, let me add that it is also wrong and unfair to call into question the loyalty of millions of American Jews who have faithfully supported Israel while also working tirelessly and generously to advance America’s cause, both at home and abroad. They are among our finest citizens and should be praised, not pilloried.”⁴

– *David Gergen, Director of the Center for Public Leadership at the John F. Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University and editor-at-large at U.S. News & World Report.*

¹ Benny Morris, “And Now for the Facts,” *The New Republic*, May 8, 2006. ² http://www.jewishpress.com/page.do/17970/The_Israel_Lobby_And_Academic_Malpractice.html ³ <http://www.nysun.com/pf.php?id=29470> ⁴ <http://www.usnews.com/usnews/opinion/articles/060403/3edit.htm>

Walt and Mearsheimer's Academic Affiliations Do Not Place "The Israel Lobby" Above Criticism

"The Israel Lobby' is a long, bitter, op-ed piece given a patina of respectability because of where the authors are employed."⁵

– *Richard Baehr, Chief Political Correspondent, and Ed Lasky, News Editor, "The American Thinker"*

"['The Israel Lobby'] cobbles together a lot of half-truths and untruths that have been out there on the far fringe, and gives them "academic respectability" ⁶

– *Martin Kramer, author and Wexler-Fromer Fellow of the Washington Institute on Near East Policy*

"In essence, the working paper is little more than a compilation of old, false, and authoritatively discredited charges dressed up in academic garb. The only thing new about it is the imprimatur these recycled assertions have now been given by the prominence of its authors and their institutional affiliations." ⁷

– *Alan Dershowitz, Professor at the Harvard School of Law*

Conspiracy Theory and Anti-Semitic Undertones

"I have never accused any critic of Israel of anti-Semitism in my long engagement in this kind of discussion, but I do believe that this piece raises a lot of itself to the level of anti-Semitism and it's for precisely the reason that John Mearsheimer recites here." ⁸

– *Martin Indyk, Director of the Saban Center for Middle East Policy, Senior Fellow in Foreign Policy Studies at the Brookings Institution*

"['The Israel Lobby'] really deserves the contempt of the American people ... and it amounts to "the same old anti-Semitic and anti-Zionist drivel ... dishonest so-called intellectuals [Walt and Mearsheimer] are entitled to their stupidity ... [but it is] the right of the rest of us to expose them for being the anti-Semites they are." ⁹

– *Rep. Eliot Engel D (NY)*

"If by anti-Semitism one means obsessive and irrationally hostile beliefs about Jews; if one accuses them of disloyalty, subversion or treachery, of having occult powers and of participating in secret combinations that manipulate institutions and governments; if one systematically selects everything unfair, ugly or wrong about Jews as individuals or a group and equally systematically suppresses any exculpatory information – why, yes, this paper is anti-Semitic ... It is merely, and unforgivably, bigotry." ¹⁰

– *Eliot A. Cohen, Professor at Johns Hopkins University's School of Advanced International Studies*

⁵ http://www.americanthinker.com/2006/03/stephen_walts_war_with_israel.html ⁶ http://www.geocities.com/martinkramerorg/2006_03_17.htm
⁷ http://www.huffingtonpost.com/alan-dershowitz/the-lobby-jews-and-anti_b_18998.html ⁸ <http://www.scribemediamedia.org/2006/10/10/transcript-israel-lobby/>
⁹ http://www.nysun.com/article/29554?page_no=1 ¹⁰ <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2006/04/04/AR2006040401282.html>

POINT

COUNTERPOINT

Walt and Mearsheimer's Claims	Expert Responses
<p>"Al Qaeda leaders, including bin Laden, are motivated by Israel's presence in Jerusalem and the plight of the Palestinians."¹</p>	<p>"Bin Laden's gang emerged from a whole series of tough and reactionary battles in Central and Eastern Asia, from the war for a separate Muslim state in the Philippines to the fighting in Kashmir, the Uighur territories in China, and of course Afghanistan. There are hardly any Palestinians in its ranks, and its communiqués have been notable for how little they say about the Palestinian struggle."²</p> <p>– <i>Christopher Hitchens, Investigative Journalist</i></p>
<p>"If Washington could live with a nuclear Soviet Union, a nuclear China, or even a nuclear North Korea, then it can live with a nuclear Iran."³</p>	<p>"Iran's worrying development of a threatening capability is matched by threatening rhetoric, including direct threats to Europe. Referring to possible war between Israel and the Palestinians, [Iran's President Ahmadinejad] stated ... 'if a storm begins, the dimensions will not stay limited to Palestine, and you may get hurt.'"⁴</p> <p>– <i>Daniel Fried, U.S. State Department</i></p>
<p>"The Lobby also has significant leverage over the Executive branch. That power derives in part from the influence Jewish voters have on presidential elections."⁵</p>	<p>"I never once saw a decision in the Oval Office to tilt U.S. foreign policy in favor of Israel at the expense of America's interest. Other than Richard Nixon – who occasionally said terrible things about Jews, despite the number on his team – I can't remember any president even talking about an Israeli lobby."⁶</p> <p>– <i>David Gergen, Former Presidential Adviser</i></p>
<p>The U.S.-Israel relationship was not created by mutual interest but rather by pressure from "The Lobby" which "sought to shape the core elements of U.S. Middle East policy" in favor of Israel.⁷</p>	<p>"The major breakthroughs in U.S.-Israeli relations occurred after the 1967 Six-Day war ... It was the Israeli military that achieved what AIPAC had not: a general acceptance among U.S. policymakers that close relations with Israel was an asset to U.S. national security and regional interests."⁸</p> <p>– <i>David Verbeeten, Academic</i></p>

1 Mearsheimer, John & Walt, Stephen, "The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy", Kennedy School of Government Working Paper Number: RWP06-011, March 13, 2006, p. 5.
2 Hitchens, Christopher, "Overstating Jewish Power", <http://www.slate.com/id/2138741/>, March 27, 2006 Accessed: July 10th, 2007. 3 Mearsheimer, John & Walt, Stephen, "The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy", Kennedy School of Government Working Paper Number: RWP06-011, March 13, 2006, p. 39. 4 Fried, Daniel, "Testimony before House Foreign Affairs Sub-committees on Europe and Terrorism", May 3, 2007 accessed at: <http://foreignaffairs.house.gov/110/fr050307.htm>. 5 Mearsheimer, John & Walt, Stephen, "The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy", Kennedy School of Government Working Paper Number: RWP06-011, March 13, 2006, p. 18. 6 Gergen, David, "An Unfair Attack", US News and World Report, March 26th, 2006. 7 Mearsheimer, John & Walt, Stephen, "The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy", Kennedy School of Government Working Paper Number: RWP06-011, March 13, 2006, pg 26. 8 Verbeeten, David, "How Important is the Israel Lobby?" Middle East Quarterly Fall, 2006.

POINT**COUNTERPOINT**

Walt and Mearsheimer's Claims	Expert Responses
<p>"Indeed, the mere existence of the [Israel] Lobby suggests that unconditional support for Israel is not in the American national interest. If it was, one would not need an organized special interest group to bring it about."⁹</p>	<p>"Walt and Mearsheimer's asinine assertion means that every American interest group – from the elderly to the insurance industry, from the Muslims to gun owners to organic food lovers – stands opposed to the American national interest simply by existing."¹⁰</p> <p>– <i>Caroline Glick, Journalist</i></p>
<p>US "largesse [to Israel] is especially striking when one realizes that Israel is now a wealthy industrial state with a per capita income roughly equal to South Korea or Spain."¹¹</p>	<p>"Interesting that the authors mention Israel being a wealthy industrial state, like South Korea. The implication being that South Korea doesn't get huge amounts of U.S. aid, while Israel, supposedly because of the lobby, does, to the tune of about \$3 Billion annually. However, we have had around 40,000 U.S. soldiers stationed in South Korea for about 50 years ... And what do those troops and their equipment and other related items cost the U.S.? About \$3 Billion a year."¹²</p> <p>– <i>Alex Safian, Ph.D.</i></p>
<p>"Israeli officials have long claimed that the Arabs fled because their leaders told them to, but careful scholarship (much of it by Israeli historians like Morris) have demolished this myth."¹³</p>	<p>"Like many pro-Arab propagandists at work today, Mearsheimer and Walt often cite my own books, sometimes quoting directly from them, in apparent corroboration of their arguments. Yet their work is a travesty of the history that I have studied and written for the past two decades."¹⁴</p> <p>– <i>Benny Morris, Historian</i></p>
<p>"Moreover, pro-Arab interest groups are weak to non-existent, which makes the Lobby's task even easier."¹⁵</p>	<p>"Does Israel have supporters in the U.S. that back a strong relationship between the two countries? Clearly, networks of such support exist, as they do for U.S. ties with Britain, Greece, Turkey, and India. There are also states like Saudi Arabia that have tried to tilt U.S. policy using a vast array of powerful PR firms, former diplomats, and well-connected officials."¹⁶</p> <p>– <i>Dore Gold, Former Ambassador to the U.N.</i></p>

⁹ Mearsheimer, John & Walt, Stephen, "The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy", Kennedy School of Government Working Paper Number: RWP06-011, March 13, 2006, p. 43. ¹⁰ Glick, Caroline, "The Jewish Threat," <http://www.JewishWorldReview.com>, March 24, 2006. ¹¹ Mearsheimer, John & Walt, Stephen, "The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy", Kennedy School of Government Working Paper Number: RWP06-011, March 13, 2006, p. 2. ¹² Safian, Alex, "Study Decrying 'Israel Lobby' Marred by Numerous Errors", <http://www.camera.org/> April 6 2006, Accessed July 10, 2007. ¹³ Mearsheimer, John & Walt, Stephen, "The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy", Kennedy School of Government Working Paper Number: RWP06-011, March 13, 2006, p. 10. ¹⁴ Morris, Benny, "And Now For Some Facts," New Republic May 8th, 2006. ¹⁵ Mearsheimer, John & Walt, Stephen, "The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy", Kennedy School of Government Working Paper Number: RWP06-011, March 13, 2006, p. 16. ¹⁶ Gold, Dore, "The Basis of the U.S.-Israel Alliance," Jerusalem Issue Brief, Vol. 5, No. 20, March 24, 2006

Walt and Mearsheimer's book has disturbing similarities to the Protocols of the Elders of Zion, an anti-Semitic forgery about Jews plotting to take over and rule the world, and...

Anti-Semitic Theme	Walt & Mearsheimer ¹
Jews Control the Media	Under the section "Manipulating the Media," the Israel Lobby "discourage[s] unfavorable reporting on Israel ..." (p.21).
Jews Control Academia	Under "Policing Academia": "The Lobby attempt[s] to blacklist and intimidate scholars ... [to] eliminate criticism of Israel from college campuses ..." (pp. 22-23).
Jews Control Debate	Under "The Great Silencer": "One of the Lobby's most powerful weapons [is] the charge of anti-Semitism ..." against anyone "who criticizes Israeli actions or says that pro-Israel groups have significant influence ..." (p.24).
Jews Control the Political System	"The Lobby also has significant leverage over the Executive branch ... [through] large campaign donations to candidates from both parties" and through occupying "important positions in the executive branch ..." (pp. 18-19).
The Lobby/Jews Want Israeli Hegemony	"Maintaining US support for Israel's policies ... is a core goal of the Lobby, but its ambitions do not stop there. It also wants America to help Israel remain the dominant regional power ..." (p.30).
The Lobby/Israel Promotes Myths and Hides the Truth	"... [T]he Lobby strives to ensure that public discourse about Israel portrays it in a positive light, by repeating myths about Israel and its founding and by publicizing Israel's side in the policy debates of the day" (p.16).

Disturbing similarities to Henry Ford's anti-Semitic book, The International Jew (1920).

Protocols ²	Henry Ford's <i>International Jew</i> ³
<p>"... the Press ... has fallen into our hands. Through the press we have gained the power to influence while remaining ourselves in the shade ..." Protocol II (5).</p>	<p>Jews "absolutely control the circulation of publications throughout the country ... [and] they receive daily an amount of favorable publicity which would be impossible did they not have the facilities for creating and distributing it themselves" (p.9).</p>
<p>"In order to effect the destruction of all collective forces except ours, we shall emasculate ... the Universities, by re-educating them in a new direction." Protocol XVI (1).</p>	<p>"All through the Protocols, the preeminence of the Jews in ... teaching ... is insisted upon [T]hey are also the chief teachers of political economy in our universities, the chief authors ... of ... popular textbooks ..." (p.160).</p>
<p>"Nowadays, if any States raise a protest against us it is only PRO FORMA ... for their Anti-Semitism is indispensable to us ..." Protocol IX (2).</p>	<p>"Anyone who essays to discuss the Jewish Question ... must be fully prepared to be regarded as an Anti-Semite ..." (p.63).</p>
<p>"... we shall arrange elections in favor of such presidents who ... will be trustworthy agents for the accomplishment of our plans ..." Protocol X (13).</p>	<p>"This is the practice known as using 'Gentile fronts' There is no function of the American Presidency in which Jews have not already assisted in a very important degree" (p.135).</p>
<p>The passages above "prove that the desire for a 'National Home' in Palestine is only camouflage and an infinitesimal part of the Jews' real object ..." p.12 Preface.</p>	<p>"There are ancient prophecies to the effect that the Jew will return to his own land and from that center rule the world" (p.8).</p>
<p>"We shall contrive to prove that we are benefactors who have restored to the rent and mangled earth the true good and also freedom of the person" Protocol XXII (3).</p>	<p>The idea "seems to be fixed ... that any writing which does not simply cloy and drip in syrupy sweetness toward things Jewish is born of prejudice and hatred" (p.63).</p>

1 Mearshheimer, John & Walt, Stephen, "The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy," April, 2006. Page numbers are from the PDF file on the Harvard University website at [http://ksgnotes1.harvard.edu/Research/wpaper.nsf/rwp/RWP06-011/\\$File/rwp_06_011_walt.pdf](http://ksgnotes1.harvard.edu/Research/wpaper.nsf/rwp/RWP06-011/$File/rwp_06_011_walt.pdf). 2 Marsden, Victor E., (ed.), *The Protocols of the Elders of Zion*, Filiquarian Publishing, 2006. 3 Ford, Henry, *The International Jew*, Filiquarian Publishing, 2007

Extremists Endorse “The Israel Lobby”

Former Leader of the KKK David Duke:

“I have read about the report and read one summary already, and I am surprised how excellent it is It is quite satisfying to see a body in the premier American University essentially come out and validate every major point I have been making since even before the war even started.” ¹



Egyptian Muslim Brotherhood’s guidance council, Abdulmo’em Abulfotah:

“I think that the people who wrote that report were working for the interest of the American people.” ²



Hamas, PLO

The paper is also getting heavy play on websites operated by the Arab satellite television network Al Jazeera, the Islamic extremist group Hamas, and the Palestine Liberation Organization. ³



Holocaust Denier and director of the Institute for Historical Review Mark Weber:

“The Israel Lobby and US Foreign Policy,” is a “carefully written, judiciously worded and copiously referenced paper.” It should be applauded as a “landmark event and as an important breakthrough.” ⁴



Source: <http://www.revisionists.com/revisionists/weber.html>

¹ <http://www.nysun.com/article/29380>. ² *Ibid.* ³ www.boston.com/news/education/higher/articles/2006/03/29/israel_lobby_critique_roils_academe/?page=2. ⁴ http://www.ihr.org/news/0703_meeting.shtml

StandWithUs

For more material and updates on the Walt and Mearsheimer book, we invite you to check our website at www.standwithus.com, and go to “Flyers.”

Register today for weekly news alerts at www.standwithus.com.
If you’re a student or alumni, register at www.StandWithUsCampus.com

StandWithUs, P.O. Box 341069, Los Angeles, CA 90034-1069
info@standwithus.com

© 2007 StandWithUs.com. All rights reserved.

08/07 SWU383